

MINUTES

PROCEEDINGS OF THE COUNCIL OF THE LONDON BOROUGH OF CAMDEN HELD AT COUNCIL CHAMBER, TOWN HALL, JUDD STREET, LONDON WC1H 9JE AT 7.00 PM MONDAY, 22ND JULY, 2024

MEMBERS PRESENT

The Mayor, Councillor Samata Khatoon (in the Chair), and;

Eddie Hanson	Rebecca Filer	Shah Miah
Sagal Abdi-Wali	Sabrina Francis	Jenny Mulholland
Steve Adams	Edmund Frondigoun	Awale Olad
Nasim Ali OBE	Julian Fulbrook	Richard Olszewski
Meric Apak	Tommy Gale	Andrew Parkinson
Camron Aref-Adib	Lorna Greenwood	Lorraine Revah
Ajok Athian	Sharon Hardwick	Lorna Russell
Kemi Atolagbe	Adam Harrison	Nadia Shah
Lotis Bautista	Jenny Headlam-Wells	Tom Simon
Marcus Boyland	Nancy Jirira	Jonathan Simpson MBE
Anna Burrage	Heather Johnson	James Slater
Linda Chung	Matthew Kirk	Stephen Stark
Matt Cooper	Izzy Lenga	Shiva Tiwari
Richard Cotton	Rishi Madlani	Nanouche Umeadi
Judy Dixey	Liam Martin Lane	Sue Vincent
Nasrine Djemai	Sylvia McNamara	Anna Wright

MEMBERS ABSENT

Councillors Pat Callaghan, Nina De Ayala Parker and Nazma Rahman.

The minutes should be read in conjunction with the agenda for the meeting. They are subject to approval and signature at the next meeting of the Council and any corrections approved at that meeting will be recorded in those minutes.

1. MINUTES

RESOLVED –

THAT the minutes of the meetings held on 4th March 2024 and 15th May 2024 be approved and signed as a correct record.

2. DECLARATIONS BY MEMBERS OF STATUTORY DISCLOSABLE PECUNIARY INTERESTS, COMPULSORY REGISTERABLE NON-PECUNIARY INTERESTS AND VOLUNTARY REGISTERABLE NON-PECUNIARY INTERESTS IN MATTERS ON THIS AGENDA

There were no declarations of interest.

3. SPECIAL ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM THE MAYOR, THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OR OTHER RELEVANT OFFICERS, AND ANY OTHER MEMBERS WHO THE MAYOR HAS AGREED MAY MAKE AN ANNOUNCEMENT

Broadcasting of the meeting

The Mayor announced that the meeting was being broadcast live to the internet and the broadcast would remain available for twelve months, after which it could be made available on request. Anyone addressing the meeting was deemed to be consenting to having their contribution recorded and broadcast and to the use of those recordings for webcasting and/or training purposes.

Item 11, Waiver of Six Month Councillor Attendance Rule

Members were pleased to note that Councillor Chung was in attendance and therefore noted that the Borough Solicitor had withdrawn the report for agenda item 11.

New Mayoral Escort

The Mayor confirmed that Rena Labongo was to be added to the list of Mayoral escorts.

Camden Irish Centre

Councillor Simpson announced that Gary Dunne was stepping down after 10 years as the Creative Director of the Camden Irish Centre. Councillor Simpson expressed thanks to Gary for the contribution the Irish Centre had made to Camden during those 10 years.

4. COMMUNICATIONS

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Callaghan and De Ayala Parker.

5. DEPUTATIONS AND PETITIONS

A deputation was heard from Kirsteen McDonagh of Maitland Park Tenants and Residents Association about Maitland Park Estate Community Hall, as per the deputation statement circulated to Members and published on the website.

Members then asked questions of the depute and the Cabinet Member for Better Homes then responded to the deputation.

6. ELECTION OF THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

The Mayor called for nominations for the position of Leader of the Council, to serve until the annual Council meeting after the next whole Council elections.

Councillor Greenwood moved the following motion and made a speech in support of Councillor Olszewski:

THAT Councillor Richard Olszewski be elected Leader of the Council for the remaining term of this Council and until the annual meeting after the next ordinary whole Council elections.

Councillor Olad seconded the motion and made a speech in support of Councillor Olszewski's nomination.

On being put to the vote it was:

RESOLVED –

THAT Richard Olszewski be elected Leader of the Council for the remaining term of this Council and until the annual meeting after the next ordinary whole Council elections.

Councillor Olszewski, Leader of the Council, made a brief speech in which he indicated that he would be making appointments to the Cabinet in the next few weeks.

7. THEMED DEBATE ON SUPPORT TO CARERS IN CAMDEN

Councillor Wright introduced the report and the Council then heard from the following speakers:

Arun Kumar spoke about the many challenges of being a carer and that at some point in all our lives we would either be a carer or be cared for. It was therefore important for the Carers Action Plan to set the standard for everyone involved in care in Camden. As a single parent carer of a child with severe learning needs and autism, Arun described the demands of the role that was often not taken on by

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

choice. There were very few male carers; it was socially isolating and incredibly hard work; personal health took less priority; careers were put on hold; sleep deprivation took its toll; and there was financial hardship with the additional impact of the cost of living crisis. Arun called on the Action Plan to raise awareness of who carers were and what they did. There should be better collaboration between service providers and improvements made to respite services, with proper assessments of the support carers needed in order to achieve a carer friendly Camden.

Angela Tebe spoke about experiencing different carer roles over the last 25 years, as a daughter, a mother and as someone who had only relatively recently described themselves as a carer. Angela also spoke about: valuing the carer role and ensuring that their needs were met; the challenge of navigating the transition from children services to adult services, and having to seek out services that were available but poorly signposted. Angela hoped that the Carers Action Plan would address these issues as well as issues around the built environment, where physical accessibility and mobility obstacles created additional problems for carers, and made them reliant on cars or isolated if they did not have a car. If these changes were made, they would benefit everyone in the borough.

Roushanara Khan shared the experience of having provided multifaceted caring roles as a parent to two daughters, each with very different specific special needs, and also caring for an elderly mother who had survived cancer and a son. Roushanara described it as a roller coaster of emotions, living in survival mode under the stress of financial constraints and unable to make ends meet. Roushanara spoke about a passion for voluntary work with people with special needs and the vulnerable,- that had led to the role of Chair of Camden Carers Voice. It had been a privilege to share in the co-production of the Carers Action Plan, it would provide an A to Z directory for carers and professionals and help to provide better care and services.

Kate White spoke as a carer for John, who had been Kate's partner and whose photograph was shown to the Council. John had died 3 years ago at the age of 86. He had lived with Alzheimer's for 12 years, 9 years of which had been spent in Camden with local neighbourhood support and he had remained very engaged in life. Kate was involved as a volunteer and advocate for people living with Dementia in Camden, that had led to involvement in the Carers Action Plan. Kate described the role of being a carer as one that took a toll on everyone involved in providing emotional, physical and emotional support. Carers needed financial and practical support and the fragmentation of services was a huge issue for carers. It was hoped that the Action Plan would address these issues, end fragmentation and bring together social health and third sector providers to work in collaboration.

Jessica Hirst spoke about the experience of becoming a young carer. At the age of 16 two weeks before the start of GCSE exams Jessica's father had been diagnosed with a rare blood cancer and autoimmune disease. This was then followed by Jessica's grandfather being diagnosed with throat cancer. There was a lack of choice for young people in these situations, their lives were put on hold, they were unheard, unpaid, with a very basic education, no career and exhausted emotionally

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

and physically. Jessica asked the Council to consider the ways that they could help young carers.

Allegra Lynch, Camden Carers Chief Executive Officer, spoke about the work of the charity that had been based in Camden for 30 years and their links to other carer organisations in the borough. Allegra informed the Council that 1 in 5 people would be carers at some point in their lives. Although many did not identify themselves as such, early identification was key to carers getting the resources they needed to support them in their roles. The life of carers was unpaid work with no rights, breaks or holidays. With many having experienced barriers after having to give up education/paid employment, pausing careers and putting their lives on hold. Carers wanted to be respected, consulted and have access to joined up resources. The launch of the Carers Action Plan could be the start of making a difference to the lives and roles of carers in Camden.

Becca Dove, Head of Children and Learning Transformation Camden Council added to the information heard about young carers, many of whom were in secondary school. Census data from 2021 had reported that there were 395 young carers in Camden, with the true number likely to now be significantly higher. These young people reported providing care ranging from 17 hours to over 50 hours a week. Some children had spoken about the positive aspects of caring and had been trusted with responsibility, learned skills and formed close bonds. Many of the young people considered their caring roles as normal. For other children, caring responsibilities had a difficult effect on their experience of childhood and had been associated with an increased risk of emotional and mental health needs. Camden Council and its partner organisations wanted to ensure that young carers and their families had the support they need to thrive. The young carers strategy would be updated later in 2024 in a process codesigned and led by young carers, with the aim of building support for children and young people who were carers.

Members of the Council thanked the carers and speakers for sharing their experiences and then commented and asked questions as follows:-

- What had been the carers experience of arranging respite care?
- The guest speakers were thanked for articulating the complexities of providing care in the borough. Was there some way that they could receive some public recognition for their role? Perhaps a badge of pride scheme in recognition and appreciation for the role of carers.
- The Carers Champion and Older People's Champion welcomed the codesign of the Action Plan in giving a voice to service users. The Carers Action Plan should make a difference to the lives of carers and their families and should be integral to the work of all the Council's departments.
- A number of Councillors had been carers and spoke first hand of the challenging experiences faced by carers. How difficult it had been, lives had been turned upside down, lack of access to support, the practicalities of day to day living and the lack of accessibility to services.

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- Who cares for carers and the obstacles they face physically, emotionally and which organisations were there to help them?
- The commitment to the development of the Carers Action Plan was noted. All those who had contributed to the plan and the difference it could make to the lives of carers in the borough was welcomed.
- Members welcomed the Carers Action Plan and wanted to see improvements to the practical support that could be provided. This needed to be more than a tick box exercise, the Council needed to take action.
- The fragmentation of services was an issue that needed to be looked at. Carers were often thrust into their role and should not have the added problem of having to navigate a complex process.
- Which organisations had been most helpful and had there been effective signposting to services?
- Some caring situations were short term, the commitment to long term caring was commended.
- The complexities of transport arrangements and practical arrangements for carers was difficult.
- Carers felt left out of discussions about their loved ones that impacted on the lives of the carers. Carers should be included in the development of the care plans that they would be responsible for implementing.
- What had been the young carer's experience of respite care and what more could have been done to help?
- Members noted the contribution of the British Somali Community Centre and the Bengali Workers Association in the Carers Action plan. The Age UK team at Great Croft in Kings Cross was thanked for their work in support of carers across the borough. Could more be done to raise awareness about the work of these organisations?
- What mental health support was provided to bereaved carers when the person they cared for died?
- Providing care was most often associated with adult social care. What had been the specific challenges of caring for children?
- What support was there for carers to look after their own health needs in challenging caring situations? When did they get the opportunities to attend checkups and screenings that most people take for granted?
- What single most significant outcome could the Council deliver to demonstrate that it had done its duty, to make the lives of young carers easier.

The guest speakers gave the following response to questions from members of the Council:-

- One carer described obtaining respite care as challenging. For a child with specific care needs, 10 carers were needing over the respite period. Arranging respite was a long process, with a long waiting list and was complex to implement.
- A young carer responded that being a carer was so much more than a 9 to 5 job. The responsibility was 24/7, with no time for yourself other than going to school, and it was hard for those who were not carers to fully understand the demands of the role.

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- Another carer spoke about not having received any respite care for 19 years and only finding out from another carer that such a thing existed. Respite care was not readily available, and relied on finding a charity to fund particular needs, making an application and then waiting 16 weeks to find out if the application had been successful. Finding a provider to meet specific needs was difficult, included long waiting lists, a lack of funding and limited services.
- One of the most challenging experiences had been dealing with Camden. The process to get a statement to meet the needs of a hearing impaired child at an appropriate nursery school had taken 500 emails. The child eventually got a nursery place but then there had been ongoing issues with the Council for 14 years about funding school places. Navigating services on behalf of a child had been difficult. It had meant giving up a career to have the time to care for a child that had been ill for 8 years and dealing with the practicalities of providing that care. This was the reality for many carers of young children. Camden had some brilliant services whilst others were lacking.
- Some carers had been unable to work because they needed to get a child to the services they needed, with no practical support to get the child there.
- The personal health of carers often suffered and they had to be reminded to look after their own health needs because they put others first. Camden Carers worked hard to remind carers to look after themselves and had developed a head to toe health check list for carers, that included reminders about health screening.
- Camden Carers provided a bereavement service. Community support from professionals and social support from the local community had helped bereaved carers.
- A young carer spoke about how support back into education, employment, career planning and helping with mental health would be essential to improving the lives of young carers.
- Work in schools, access to learning, extra-curricular activities, social support and pathways into employment would make a significant difference to the lives of young carers.

Councillor Wright thanked the guest speakers for sharing their experiences of being carers and the contributions they had made to the themed debate. There was a determination that the Carers Action Plan would not be a tick box exercise and there was a commitment to delivering on the aims of the plan, not just from the Council but also from partnership organisations across a range of services.

Councillor Wright also thanked the carers who had invested time and energy in the codesign of the Action Plan. The plan would provide a platform for carers to ensure that they were seen and heard, it would be overseen by the Borough Partnership Carers Board led by carers, with a clear framework for oversight and delivery. Not all carers identified as carers or were aware of their rights. Councillor Wright asked Members of the Council to reflect on the people they knew who could be helped to access the resources that were available. Carers should not have to fight any more for the support they needed and the Carers Action Plan would be part of that change.

The Mayor thanked the speakers for attending.

RESOLVED –

THAT the report be noted.

THE DEPUTY MAYOR IN THE CHAIR

8. STATEMENT BY THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL AND QUESTIONS TO THE LEADER AND CABINET MEMBERS

Councillor Richard Olszewski, Leader of the Council, made a statement to those present. Councillor Tom Simon, Leader of the Liberal Democrat Group, and Councillor Steve Adams, Leader of the Conservative Group, made statements in response and then Councillor Olszewski made some final remarks.

The Leader and Cabinet Members then took questions from Members as follows:-

- Councillor Dixey asked the Leader of the Council what proactive steps could be taken in response to the steady closure of bank branches, to support vulnerable tenants and small businesses dealing in cash and whether banking hubs could be the solution. Councillor Olszewski responded that the Council would provide support where it could on the impact of the changing high street, but Camden was not responsible for the banking system and that many of the solutions raised by Councillor Dixey would involve interventions from central government. The Council would continue to support those people who were digitally excluded to acquire skills to help lessen the impact of the reduction of services from the high street. In response to a supplementary question about a recent global IT outage, the reliance on online services and how the Council had been affected, Councillor Olszewski remarked that those affected by the outage were organisations reliant on the cyber security used by Microsoft and that the Council had not been affected.
- Councillor Athian asked the Leader of the Council about what had been done to build on the role of Camden as a Borough of Sanctuary. In response Councillor Olszewski spoke about how Camden had been a welcoming borough for generations, gave credit to those across the Council that had contributed in the work towards becoming a Borough of Sanctuary in June and the importance of providing reassurance to all communities in Camden. In a supplementary comment, Councillor Athian, thanked Councillor Abdi-Wali, and all those involved, for the work for Camden to become a Borough of Sanctuary for refugees.
- Councillor Parkinson asked the Cabinet Member for a Sustainable Camden about the continued mismanagement of e-bikes in Frognal ward where the bikes had been left on pavements and in hotspot areas where the operators

had not managed the bays efficiently. When the e-bike contracts were renewed would Camden commit to imposing a small fine on e-bike operators for bikes left outside designated areas to encourage them to take further action?

Councillor Harrison responded that, Camden was one of first boroughs to establish agreements with operators to give itself some contractual powers. Under the contract operators were obliged to remove reported bikes left outside a bay within an hour, and over the past year there had been compliance by the operators but there were still some locations where there had been overflowing bike bays. The operators had been contacted to manage the bays more effectively and or expand them. Future plans included a move to a London wide a contract with operators that would be managed by Transport for London, with an approach that would be clearer for e-bike users. In response to a supplementary question, that responsibility was being left with residents to raise the breaches and if that reporting system could be made easier via Camden App, Councillor Harrison agreed to look at the way that reporting took place.

- Councillor Umeadi asked the Cabinet Member for a Sustainable Camden about the Brent Camden and Westminster joint consultation to improve Kilburn Highroad, and would the consultation ensure participation from diverse groups of people. In response Councillor Harrison remarked on the High Road being one of the busiest roads in London, and that changes to pavements, bus lanes, cycle crossings, new greenery and seating that would be transformative for the people of Kilburn. Consultations would include community events to raise awareness and to ensure that there were opportunities for communities to have their say.

THE MAYOR IN THE CHAIR

9. BUSINESS FROM THE ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING OF 4TH MARCH 2024

Consideration was given to a report of the Borough Solicitor.

RESOLVED –

THAT the report be noted.

10. APPOINTMENTS TO FORMAL COUNCIL BODIES

As there were no nominations, this report was not considered.

11. WAIVER OF SIX MONTH COUNCILLOR ATTENDANCE RULE

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

This item had been withdrawn from the agenda by the Borough Solicitor because Councillor Chung had attended the Resources and Corporate Performance Scrutiny Committee on 15th July.

12. MOTIONS

Consideration was given to the following motion, notice of which was given by Councillor Kirk as an amendment and which was seconded by Councillor Dixey:-

This Council notes:

- I. The UK music industry is a global leader - producing world famous artists and bringing joy to millions. Camden is at its heart. And music is at the heart of Camden life.*
- II. In the classical and jazz worlds, the Jazz Café, Conway Hall, the Red Hedgehog and the Fidelio Café are all within the Borough. So is the Royal College of Music. The Royal Opera House, Kings Place and the Barbican lie on its borders. Camden is home to the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment and to dozens of semi-professional and amateur orchestras and instrumental groups; the Highgate Choir and scores of others.*
- III. Many great albums and film scores have been - and are being - recorded in Air Studios or Camden's other recording venues.*
- IV. In contemporary music, with 28 Grassroots venues Camden has one of the highest concentrations of venues anywhere in the country and is famous for its thriving music scene. Camden's music venues have launched the careers of Coldplay, Madness, Amy Winehouse and Dua Lipa among others.*
- V. Grassroots music venues in London currently operate with average margins of 0.2%. Twenty-seven London venues ceased offering live music during 2023, with 12 closing entirely.*
- VI. The House of Commons Department for Culture, Media and Sport Committee (DCMS) report "Grassroots Music Venues", April 2024, recommended a levy on the largest live music venues to fund grassroots music venues. It called for a voluntary industry scheme by September 2024, failing which the government to introduce a statutory levy at the earliest opportunity.*
- VII. The "Agent of Change" (AOC) principle was included in the National Policy Planning Framework (NPPF) in 2018. Despite this, abatement notices are still being issued to longstanding venues (e.g. Flying Circus, Newark), and developers are not always held to account for implementing agreed mitigations (e.g. Night & Day in Manchester).*
- VIII. The limited inclusion of the AOC principle in the current Local Plan and the strengthening of the principle in the draft new Local Plan.*
- IX. The courts have recognised that musicians have a right to practice at home for five hours a day, three on Sunday [e.g. RBKC v Carrabino (2017)]. But councils have not consistently applied these rulings, and musicians often do not have the resources to take legal action. The well-publicised conflict between Fiona Fey and Lewisham **Newham** Council is a striking example.*
- X. There is clear evidence that learning to play a musical instrument not only enriches a child culturally but has a substantial beneficial effect on their academic and social development, and yet participation in, and funding*

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

for, music education is both in decline and unequal. Only 15% of state schools pupils received sustained music tuition. The figure is 50% in independent schools.

- XI. Prime Minister Sir Keir Starmer's call for all children to have the chance to learn a musical instrument at school.*
- XII. AI is a powerful tool for creatives, but it is also set to cause significant disruption in the music industry – including negatively impacting creators' ability to protect their IP.*

This Council believes:

- A. There are many challenges facing the music industry. Covid and the cost of living crisis hit musicians and venues hard. Brexit has created a hefty barrier to touring and a challenge to the music colleges. Arts Council funding has reduced by 16% over the last seven years and the cuts announced last year were devastating for Camden institutions. Unregulated AI may prevent creatives from earning from their work. At the same time, fewer of our children are learning musical instruments with the sharpest declines in the state sector and for the least privileged children.*
- B. The failure to address these challenges today will undermine the future of the music industry in the UK.*
- C. Camden is a leader in promoting music at all levels - and should lead by example, by putting safeguards in place to protect musicians and venues, while being fair to all residents of Camden.*
- D. Camden Council does excellent work to help schools deliver music education but there is always scope to go further. We believe that every child, from every background, should have the right to a free musical instrument education.*
- E. Musicians should not have to go to court to ensure the common law judgements on musicians and noise complaints are respected by local councils.*

This Council resolves to:

- 1. Protect local venues by ensuring that the AOC principle is applied in practice, in particular by:*
 - Withholding planning permission for developments next to venues in the absence of enforceable conditions for appropriate soundproofing.*
 - Rigorously enforcing such conditions.*
- 2. Furthermore, take the AOC principle into account when assessing complaints about venues, from existing developments, specifically when:*

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- a. *The complainant has knowingly moved next to an existing venue and then complains about the noise.*
 - b. *A venue has materially changed its times of operation or there is a significant, measurable and consistent increase in noise levels which could reasonably be considered to impact existing neighbouring residents.*
3. *Commit to upholding the common law position on musicians practicing at home, so that musicians' can exercise a right to practice in their own home within reasonable hours – and ensuring no musicians who are council tenants are forced out of their home or otherwise penalised for reasonable music practice.*
 4. *Move towards providing every primary school child two years free small-group instrumental lessons, and a free instrument, following the example of Lewisham's Every Child A Musician programme.*

This Council calls on the new Government to:

1. *Protect venues by acting on the recommendation of the DCMS committee in April 2024 – implementing a levy on the largest music venues after September 2024, if a voluntary levy has not been agreed, or is not raising sufficient funds.*
2. *Further protect grassroots music by making the current 75% business rates discount a permanent change for small studios & grassroots venues.*
3. *Negotiate free, simple short-term travel for UK artists to perform in the EU, and vice-versa, including transport of equipment and sale of merchandise.*
4. *Invest in Music Education including by:*
 - *Training and recruiting 1000 music teachers.*
 - *Delivering an Arts pupil premium with funding of at least £90m p/a.*
5. *To adopt the following principles regarding the responsible use of AI including:*
 - *Ensuring AI generated music is identifiable through meta data.*
 - *Ruling out new extensions to copyright which would allow the use of creative works by AI companies without permission.*
 - *Requiring records be kept of music used to train algorithms.*
 - *Introducing a new personality/image right into UK law.*

An amendment was moved by Councillor Simpson and seconded by Councillor Slater as follows:

This Council notes:

1. *The UK music industry is a global leader - producing world famous artists and bringing joy to millions. Camden is at its heart. And music is at the heart of Camden life.*

- II. *All of which is supported by the Council and Camden Learning. A great example being the biannual schools music festival that takes place at the Royal Albert Hall. This event brings together over 2000 parents and children to participate in and celebrate music, and it is streamed to over 14,000 people in 80 countries.*
- III. *In the classical and jazz worlds, the Jazz Café, Conway Hall, ~~the Red Hedgehog~~ and the Fidelio Café are all within the Borough. So is the Royal College of Music. The Royal Opera House, Kings Place and the Barbican lie on its borders. Camden is home to the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment and to dozens of semi-professional and amateur orchestras and instrumental groups; the Highgate Choir and scores of others.*
- IV. *Many great albums and film scores have been - and are being - recorded in Air Studios or Camden's other recording venues.*
- V. *In contemporary music, with 28 Grassroots venues Camden has one of the highest concentrations of venues anywhere in the country and is famous for its thriving music scene. Camden's music venues have launched the careers of Coldplay, Madness, Amy Winehouse and Dua Lipa among others.*
- VI. *Grassroots music venues in London currently operate with average margins of 0.2%. Twenty-seven London venues ceased offering live music during 2023, with 12 closing entirely.*
- VII. *The House of Commons Department for Culture, Media and Sport Committee (DCMS) report "Grassroots Music Venues", April 2024, recommended a levy on the largest live music venues to fund grassroots music venues. It called for a voluntary industry scheme by September 2024, failing which the government to introduce a statutory levy at the earliest opportunity.*
- VIII. *The "Agent of Change" (AOC) principle was included in the National Policy Planning Framework (NPPF) in 2018. Despite this, abatement notices are still being issued **by other councils and boroughs** to longstanding venues (e.g. Flying Circus, Newark), and developers are not always held to account for implementing agreed mitigations (e.g. Night & Day in Manchester).*
- IX. ***The continued AOC principle being included in Camden's Local Plan. Additionally, Camden was one of the first Local Authorities in the UK to adopt AOC. We also note that it has been used locally in negotiations where development has impacted on music venues. ~~The limited inclusion of the AOC principle in the current Local Plan and the strengthening of the principle in the draft new Local Plan.~~** The courts have recognised that musicians have a right to practice at home for five hours a day, three on Sunday [e.g. RBKC v Carrabino (2017)]. But **some** councils have not consistently applied these rulings, and musicians often do not have the resources to take legal action. The well-publicised conflict between Fiona Fey and **Lewisham Newham Council** is a striking example.*
- X. *There is clear evidence that learning to play a musical instrument not only enriches a child culturally but has a substantial beneficial effect on their academic and social development, and yet participation in, and funding for, music education is both in decline and unequal. Only 15% of state schools pupils received sustained music tuition. The figure is 50% in independent schools.*

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- XI. *The council and Camden Learning recognises the benefits of music for children. They are supporting Camden Music Trust in its initiative to bring more music to SEND children. This initiative, the Voyagers Programme is aimed at enabling SEND children to take part in social music making. It has piloted at Kentish Town Church of England Primary and at Edith Neville Primary School.*
- XII. *Singing in Primary Schools has also been given a recent boost by the successful Choir Festival held in March 2024. This involved 34 schools, 1000 children and around 1500 parents and carers were hosted across 3 nights. Of particular merit was the production values of the event, with a professional staging/lights hired in, as well as the focus on the upskilling of teachers.*
- XIII. *Labour Prime Minister Sir Keir Starmer's call for all children to have the chance to learn a musical instrument at school.*
- XIV. *AI is a powerful tool for creatives, but it is also set to cause significant disruption in the music industry – including negatively impacting creators' ability to protect their IP.*

This Council believes:

- A. *There are many challenges facing the music industry. Covid and the cost of living crisis hit musicians and venues hard. Brexit has created a hefty barrier to touring and a challenge to the music colleges. Arts Council funding has reduced by 16% over the last seven years and the cuts announced last year were devastating for Camden institutions. Unregulated AI may prevent creatives from earning from their work. At the same time, fewer of our children are learning musical instruments with the sharpest declines in the state sector and for the least privileged children.*
- B. *The failure to address these challenges today will undermine the future of the music industry in the UK.*
- C. *The Conservative – Liberal Democrat Coalition Government had a negative impact on music education by taking music directly off the education authorities and passing them to Arts Council led Music Hubs.*
- D. *Camden is a leader in promoting music at all levels - and ~~should~~ leads by example, ~~by~~ putting safeguards in place to protect musicians and venues, while being fair to all residents of Camden. Camden continues to work with the Mayor of London and his 'Culture at Risk' team to support venues in the Borough.*
- E. *Camden Council does excellent work to help schools deliver music education but there is always scope to go further. ~~We believe that~~ Our ambition is for every child, from every background, ~~should to~~ have access ~~the right~~ to a free musical instrument education.*
- F. *The brilliant work of Camden Music Trust, a charity led by parents, teachers and volunteers has enabled young people to gain access to music education for the last 12 years.*

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

G. Musicians should not have to go to court to ensure the common law judgements on musicians and noise complaints are respected by local councils.

This Council resolves to:

1. Protect local venues by ensuring that the AOC principle is applied in practice, in particular by:
 - Withholding planning permission for developments next to venues in the absence of enforceable conditions for appropriate soundproofing.
 - Rigorously enforcing such conditions.
2. Furthermore, take the AOC principle into account when assessing complaints about venues, from existing developments, specifically when:
 - a. The complainant has knowingly moved next to an existing venue and then complains about the noise.
 - b. A venue has materially changed its times of operation or there is a significant, measurable and consistent increase in noise levels which could reasonably be considered to impact existing neighbouring residents.
3. Commit to upholding the common law position on musicians practicing at home, so that musicians' can exercise a right to practice in their own home within reasonable hours – and ensuring no musicians who are council tenants are forced out of their home or otherwise penalised for reasonable music practice.
4. ~~Explore ways to build on the work Camden Music Service does in our primary schools. Move towards providing every primary school child two years free small-group instrumental lessons, and a free instrument, following the example of Lewisham's Every Child A Musician programme.~~

This Council calls on the new Government to:

5. Protect venues by acting on the recommendation of the DCMS committee in April 2024 – implementing a levy on the largest music venues after September 2024, if a voluntary levy has not been agreed, or is not raising sufficient funds.
6. ~~Further Protect grassroots music by making the current 75% replacing the business rates system with a new system that levels the playing field between the high street and online giants. discount a permanent change for small studios & grassroots venues.~~
7. Negotiate ~~free, simple short-term travel~~ touring visas for UK artists to perform in the EU, and vice-versa, including transport of equipment and sale of merchandise.
8. ~~Invest in Music Education including by:~~

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- ~~• Training and recruiting 1000 music teachers.~~
 - ~~• Delivering an Arts pupil premium with funding of at least £90m p/a.~~
4. ~~Promote music and arts education in schools by reviewing our curriculum and assessment systems to ensure a broad and balanced curriculum, recruiting 6,500 new teachers in our state schools to fill vacancies, reviewing Progress and Attainment 8 to include a creative or vocational subject and adding Arts subjects to the accountability framework. To adopt the following principles regarding the responsible use of AI including:~~
- ~~• Ensuring AI generated music is identifiable through meta data.~~
 - ~~• Ruling out new extensions to copyright which would allow the use of creative works by AI companies without permission.~~
 - ~~• Requiring records be kept of music used to train algorithms.~~
 - ~~• Introducing a new personality/image right into UK law.~~
9. ~~To recognise the potential of AI to unlock new creative frontiers, while;~~
- ~~a. Finding the right balance between fostering innovation and ensuring protection for creators and the ongoing viability of the creative industries.~~
 - ~~b. Supporting and maintaining the UK's strong copyright regime to give security to our creative communities.~~

The amended motion therefore read:

This Council notes:

- I. The UK music industry is a global leader - producing world famous artists and bringing joy to millions. Camden is at its heart. And music is at the heart of Camden life.*
- II. All of which is supported by the Council and Camden Learning. A great example being the biannual schools music festival that takes place at the Royal Albert Hall. This event brings together over 2000 parents and children to participate in and celebrate music, and it is streamed to over 14,000 people in 80 countries.*
- III. In the classical and jazz worlds, the Jazz Café, Conway Hall, and the Fidelio Café are all within the Borough. So is the Royal College of Music. The Royal Opera House, Kings Place and the Barbican lie on its borders. Camden is home to the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment and to dozens of semi-professionals and amateur orchestras and instrumental groups; the Highgate Choir and scores of others.*
- IV. Many great albums and film scores have been - and are being - recorded in Air Studios or Camden's other recording venues.*
- V. In contemporary music, with 28 Grassroots venues Camden has one of the highest concentrations of venues anywhere in the country and is famous for its thriving music scene. Camden's music venues have launched the careers of Coldplay, Madness, Amy Winehouse and Dua Lipa among others.*

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- VI. *Grassroots music venues in London currently operate with average margins of 0.2%. Twenty-seven London venues ceased offering live music during 2023, with 12 closing entirely.*
- VII. *The House of Commons Department for Culture, Media and Sport Committee (DCMS) report “Grassroots Music Venues”, April 2024, recommended a levy on the largest live music venues to fund grassroots music venues. It called for a voluntary industry scheme by September 2024, failing which the government to introduce a statutory levy at the earliest opportunity.*
- VIII. *The “Agent of Change” (AOC) principle was included in the National Policy Planning Framework (NPPF) in 2018. Despite this, abatement notices are still being issued by other councils and boroughs to longstanding venues (e.g. Flying Circus, Newark), and developers are not always held to account for implementing agreed mitigations (e.g. Night & Day in Manchester).*
- IX. *The continued AOC principle being included in Camden’s Local Plan. Additionally, Camden was one of the first Local Authorities in the UK to adopt AOC. We also note that it has been used locally in negotiations where development has impacted on music venues. The courts have recognised that musicians have a right to practice at home for five hours a day, three on Sunday [e.g. RBKC v Carrabino (2017)]. But some councils have not consistently applied these rulings, and musicians often do not have the resources to take legal action. The well-publicised conflict between Fiona Fey and Newham Council is a striking example.*
- X. *There is clear evidence that learning to play a musical instrument not only enriches a child culturally but has a substantial beneficial effect on their academic and social development, and yet participation in, and funding for, music education is both in decline and unequal. Only 15% of state schools pupils received sustained music tuition. The figure is 50% in independent schools.*
- XI. *The council and Camden Learning recognises the benefits of music for children. They are supporting Camden Music Trust in its initiative to bring more music to SEND children. This initiative, the Voyagers Programme is aimed at enabling SEND children to take part in social music making. It has piloted at Kentish Town Church of England Primary and at Edith Neville Primary School.*
- XII. *Singing in Primary Schools has also been given a recent boost by the successful Choir Festival held in March 2024. This involved 34 schools, 1000 children and around 1500 parents and carers were hosted across 3 nights. Of particular merit was the production values of the event, with a professional staging/lights hired in, as well as the focus on the upskilling of teachers.*
- XIII. *Labour Prime Minister Sir Keir Starmer’s call for all children to have the chance to learn a musical instrument at school.*
- XIV. *AI is a powerful tool for creatives, but it is also set to cause significant disruption in the music industry – including negatively impacting creators’ ability to protect their IP.*

This Council believes:

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- A. There are many challenges facing the music industry. Covid and the cost of living crisis hit musicians and venues hard. Brexit has created a hefty barrier to touring and a challenge to the music colleges. Arts Council funding has reduced by 16% over the last seven years and the cuts announced last year were devastating for Camden institutions. Unregulated AI may prevent creatives from earning from their work. At the same time, fewer of our children are learning musical instruments with the sharpest declines in the state sector and for the least privileged children.*
- B. The failure to address these challenges today will undermine the future of the music industry in the UK.*
- C. The Conservative – Liberal Democrat Coalition Government had a negative impact on music education by taking music directly off the education authorities and passing them to Arts Council led Music Hubs.*
- D. Camden is a leader in promoting music at all levels - and leads by example, putting safeguards in place to protect musicians and venues, while being fair to all residents of Camden. Camden continues to work with the Mayor of London and his 'Culture at Risk' team to support venues in the Borough.*
- E. Camden Council does excellent work to help schools deliver music education but there is always scope to go further. Our ambition is for every child, from every background, to have access to a free musical instrument education.*
- F. The brilliant work of Camden Music Trust, a charity led by parents, teachers and volunteers has enabled young people to gain access to music education for the last 12 years.*
- G. Musicians should not have to go to court to ensure the common law judgements on musicians and noise complaints are respected by local councils.*

This Council resolves to:

- 1. Protect local venues by ensuring that the AOC principle is applied in practice, in particular by:*
 - Withholding planning permission for developments next to venues in the absence of enforceable conditions for appropriate soundproofing.*
 - Rigorously enforcing such conditions.*
- 2. Furthermore, take the AOC principle into account when assessing complaints about venues, from existing developments, specifically when:*
 - a. The complainant has knowingly moved next to an existing venue and then complains about the noise.*
 - b. A venue has materially changed its times of operation or there is a significant, measurable and consistent increase in noise levels which could reasonably be considered to impact existing neighbouring residents.*

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

3. *Commit to upholding the common law position on musicians practicing at home, so that musicians' can exercise a right to practice in their own home within reasonable hours – and ensuring no musicians who are council tenants are forced out of their home or otherwise penalised for reasonable music practice.*
4. *Explore ways to build on the work Camden Music Service does in our primary schools.*

This Council calls on the new Government to:

1. *Protect venues by acting on the recommendation of the DCMS committee in April 2024 – implementing a levy on the largest music venues after September 2024, if a voluntary levy has not been agreed, or is not raising sufficient funds.*
2. *Protect grassroots music by replacing the business rates system with a new system that levels the playing field between the high street and online giants.*
3. *Negotiate touring visas for UK artists to perform in the EU, and vice-versa, including transport of equipment and sale of merchandise.*
4. *Promote music and arts education in schools by reviewing our curriculum and assessment systems to ensure a broad and balanced curriculum, recruiting 6,500 new teachers in our state schools to fill vacancies, reviewing Progress and Attainment 8 to include a creative or vocational subject and adding Arts subjects to the accountability framework.*
5. *To recognise the potential of AI to unlock new creative frontiers, while;*
 - *Finding the right balance between fostering innovation and ensuring protection for creators and the ongoing viability of the creative industries.*
 - *Supporting and maintaining the UK's strong copyright regime to give security to our creative communities.*

Councillor Kirk, the mover of the original motion, declined to accept the amendment.

There was then a short debate on the motion and the amendment.

The amendment moved by Councillors Simpson and Slater was then put to the vote and CARRIED.

The amended motion was then put to the vote and CARRIED.

RESOLVED –

This Council notes:

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- I. The UK music industry is a global leader - producing world famous artists and bringing joy to millions. Camden is at its heart. And music is at the heart of Camden life.
- II. All of which is supported by the Council and Camden Learning. A great example being the biannual schools music festival that takes place at the Royal Albert Hall. This event brings together over 2000 parents and children to participate in and celebrate music, and it is streamed to over 14,000 people in 80 countries.
- III. In the classical and jazz worlds, the Jazz Café, Conway Hall, and the Fidelio Café are all within the Borough. So is the Royal College of Music. The Royal Opera House, Kings Place and the Barbican lie on its borders. Camden is home to the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment and to dozens of semi-professionals and amateur orchestras and instrumental groups; the Highgate Choir and scores of others.
- IV. Many great albums and film scores have been - and are being - recorded in Air Studios or Camden's other recording venues.
- V. In contemporary music, with 28 Grassroots venues Camden has one of the highest concentrations of venues anywhere in the country and is famous for its thriving music scene. Camden's music venues have launched the careers of Coldplay, Madness, Amy Winehouse and Dua Lipa among others.
- VI. Grassroots music venues in London currently operate with average margins of 0.2%. Twenty-seven London venues ceased offering live music during 2023, with 12 closing entirely.
- VII. The House of Commons Department for Culture, Media and Sport Committee (DCMS) report "Grassroots Music Venues", April 2024, recommended a levy on the largest live music venues to fund grassroots music venues. It called for a voluntary industry scheme by September 2024, failing which the government to introduce a statutory levy at the earliest opportunity.
- VIII. The "Agent of Change" (AOC) principle was included in the National Policy Planning Framework (NPPF) in 2018. Despite this, abatement notices are still being issued by other councils and boroughs to longstanding venues (e.g. Flying Circus, Newark), and developers are not always held to account for implementing agreed mitigations (e.g. Night & Day in Manchester).
- IX. The continued AOC principle being included in Camden's Local Plan. Additionally, Camden was one of the first Local Authorities in the UK to adopt AOC. We also note that it has been used locally in negotiations where development has impacted on music venues. The courts have recognised that musicians have a right to practice at home for five hours a day, three on Sunday [e.g. RBKC v Carrabino (2017)]. But some councils have not consistently applied these rulings, and musicians often do not have the resources to take legal action. The well-publicised conflict between Fiona Fey and Newham Council is a striking example.
- X. There is clear evidence that learning to play a musical instrument not only enriches a child culturally but has a substantial beneficial effect on their academic and social development, and yet participation in, and funding for, music education is both in decline and unequal. Only 15% of state schools

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

pupils received sustained music tuition. The figure is 50% in independent schools.

- XI. The council and Camden Learning recognises the benefits of music for children. They are supporting Camden Music Trust in its initiative to bring more music to SEND children. This initiative, the Voyagers Programme is aimed at enabling SEND children to take part in social music making. It has piloted at Kentish Town Church of England Primary and at Edith Neville Primary School.
- XII. Singing in Primary Schools has also been given a recent boost by the successful Choir Festival held in March 2024. This involved 34 schools, 1000 children and around 1500 parents and carers were hosted across 3 nights. Of particular merit was the production values of the event, with a professional staging/lights hired in, as well as the focus on the upskilling of teachers.
- XIII. Labour Prime Minister Sir Keir Starmer's call for all children to have the chance to learn a musical instrument at school.
- XIV. AI is a powerful tool for creatives, but it is also set to cause significant disruption in the music industry – including negatively impacting creators' ability to protect their IP.

This Council believes:

- A. There are many challenges facing the music industry. Covid and the cost of living crisis hit musicians and venues hard. Brexit has created a hefty barrier to touring and a challenge to the music colleges. Arts Council funding has reduced by 16% over the last seven years and the cuts announced last year were devastating for Camden institutions. Unregulated AI may prevent creatives from earning from their work. At the same time, fewer of our children are learning musical instruments with the sharpest declines in the state sector and for the least privileged children.
- B. The failure to address these challenges today will undermine the future of the music industry in the UK.
- C. The Conservative – Liberal Democrat Coalition Government had a negative impact on music education by taking music directly off the education authorities and passing them to Arts Council led Music Hubs.
- D. Camden is a leader in promoting music at all levels - and leads by example, putting safeguards in place to protect musicians and venues, while being fair to all residents of Camden. Camden continues to work with the Mayor of London and his 'Culture at Risk' team to support venues in the Borough.
- E. Camden Council does excellent work to help schools deliver music education but there is always scope to go further. Our ambition is for every child, from every background, to have access to a free musical instrument education.

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

- F. The brilliant work of Camden Music Trust, a charity led by parents, teachers and volunteers has enabled young people to gain access to music education for the last 12 years.
- G. Musicians should not have to go to court to ensure the common law judgements on musicians and noise complaints are respected by local councils.

This Council resolves to:

1. Protect local venues by ensuring that the AOC principle is applied in practice, in particular by:
 - Withholding planning permission for developments next to venues in the absence of enforceable conditions for appropriate soundproofing.
 - Rigorously enforcing such conditions.
2. Furthermore, take the AOC principle into account when assessing complaints about venues, from existing developments, specifically when:
 - a. The complainant has knowingly moved next to an existing venue and then complains about the noise.
 - b. A venue has materially changed its times of operation or there is a significant, measurable and consistent increase in noise levels which could reasonably be considered to impact existing neighbouring residents.
3. Commit to upholding the common law position on musicians practicing at home, so that musicians' can exercise a right to practice in their own home within reasonable hours – and ensuring no musicians who are council tenants are forced out of their home or otherwise penalised for reasonable music practice.
4. Explore ways to build on the work Camden Music Service does in our primary schools.

This Council calls on the new Government to:

1. Protect venues by acting on the recommendation of the DCMS committee in April 2024 – implementing a levy on the largest music venues after September 2024, if a voluntary levy has not been agreed, or is not raising sufficient funds.
2. Protect grassroots music by replacing the business rates system with a new system that levels the playing field between the high street and online giants.
3. Negotiate touring visas for UK artists to perform in the EU, and vice-versa, including transport of equipment and sale of merchandise.
4. Promote music and arts education in schools by reviewing our curriculum and assessment systems to ensure a broad and balanced curriculum, recruiting

Council - Monday, 22nd July, 2024

6,500 new teachers in our state schools to fill vacancies, reviewing Progress and Attainment 8 to include a creative or vocational subject and adding Arts subjects to the accountability framework.

5. To recognise the potential of AI to unlock new creative frontiers, while;
 - Finding the right balance between fostering innovation and ensuring protection for creators and the ongoing viability of the creative industries.
 - Supporting and maintaining the UK's strong copyright regime to give security to our creative communities.

Motions 2 and 3 were not considered due to lack of time.

13. OPEN SESSION

Contributions were made from the following Councillors:

- Councillor Chang thanked everyone for the welcoming her back and in particular thanked the Mayor, the Chief Executive, the Borough Solicitor, the former Leader of the Council and the Liberal Democrat Group for the kindness shown during her short period of illness.
- Councillor Russell congratulated Councillor Olszewski on being elected Leader of the Council, as well as congratulating Danny Beales, Lloyd Hatton, Georgia Gould and Sian Berry at the start of their new roles as Members of Parliament. Councillor Russell went on to ask if the Council would consider taking part in an upcoming 4 day working week pilot, as it had been shown to improve staff wellbeing, employee retention, productivity and organisational flexibility.
- Councillor Simpson spoke about the event that he and Councillor McNamara had attended at the Roundhouse. It had taken place to celebrate the first year of the new centre, that had been officially opened by Sir Keir Starmer, to support young business people and young people with innovative ideas. Councillor Simpson congratulated Marcus Davey and the Roundhouse team for all their work to support young people in Camden and London.
- Councillor Boyland thanked the Council for supporting the first schools art biennale, held over 6 days with 350 art pieces submitted by Camden school pupils, and attended by 5500 visitors. It had been curated by a team from Central St Martins Art School and school teachers to celebrate the arts in Camden. Councillor Boyland thanked everyone who had contributed to making the event such a success.
- Councillor Simon also mentioned how successful the art biennale had been. He also praised Abacus Belsize Primary School, who for the second year running had achieved top SATs results in Camden, despite challenging situations. The results had been quite an achievement and had placed the school in the top 1% of primary schools in London for SATs results.

14. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE MAYOR CONSIDERS URGENT

There was no urgent business.

The meeting ended at 10.00 pm.

CHAIR

Contact Officer: Donna Alexander-Morrison

Telephone No: 020 7974 5319

E-Mail: donna.alexander-morrison@camden.gov.uk

MINUTES END